

North American Patristics Society

May 26, 2022

Jonathan Fisher, "Jesus Wept..."

- John 11 - Lazarus / Bethany
- "indignant" or "moved"
- "Jesus wept"
- Jesus' emotions become the model for Christians one
- "Emotion scripts" - the narrative structure of emotional narratives in history
- "emotions" tell, or are, a story"
- Chrysostom studied emotions
- "Emotion scripts" are for performance, not writing
- Greek homilies instead - 4th/5th cc
- emotion & Christology
 - most early theologians saw it as proof of Jesus' humanity
 - Cyril says to weep for humanity
 - other ideas: the deep hearts of Jews. solidarity w/ lost humanity (not to appear dead).
 - Theodore of Mopsuestia: His humanity not touched by pain / like hunger, sleep, etc.
- performance
 - initial stage: the fact
 - some: Jesus did not suffer grief, He allowed it

- Cyril: Jesus rubbed His feet, shed a tear, then immediately pulled them back in
- Chrysostom: Jesus wept gently, unlike the women
- arousal - rebuke - containment - typical of post-Nicene Christology

Teaching

- invariably the fathers saw Jesus at teaching
- "an anatomical theater"
- teachers should contrast Jesus' emotions of those of the pagans
- the pagans wail / not Christians
- Jesus establishes parameters
- fathers blamed women for excessive mourning

Michael Hayward, "So No One Immortal? Christian Reactions of Greek Epitaphs in Late Antiquity"

- Pythagoras's Sanctus, Lucius's Son: "I'll Best of Children"
- Moment of becoming
- "He of good courage Olympus. No one is immortal."
- Hell of Sordana "Don't be sad, no one is immortal."
- Nike Athanatos: no one is immortal

- Christian adaptation:
 - No one is immortal:
 - in this world
 - in this life
 - on earth
- Making sense of the wisdom:
 - Rituals of grieving often involve inconsistent theology
 - some believers in immortality did try to resolve the discrepancy
 - Epigraphic habits, like all real habits, are hard to break. It's easier to adapt them ~~to~~ to break them
 - traditions can fade that old signs have new meanings

Sarah V. Foster, "Resurrection and Psychology in the Koimeterion"

- synaxis
- Christians had a tomb
- "sleep" is another word for "bath" for many
- not best archeological evidence for it but is evidence for synaxis
- tomb gardens ("bleeding beds")
- funeral feasts

- excavations show that general
places were giant houses
- pythagoras - "to purify the soul" (?)
- "purifying the soul to knowledge"
- "the purifying of the soul to see
the truth on its own"
- Epicurus garden - a teaching, pleasurable life
- Ambrascus (?) teaching to the audience with slaves
- burial places of martyrs tombs Antioch?
- Jerome (?) used to talk about weeping around
the tombs
- Crispian - theatre: bad, paths: very bad bad
"strides with bad thoughts"
"strides with good thoughts"

- Alexander Lockins - Sexual Ethics and
"the protection of children"

- theory: Christians broadly condemned pedophilia
- proposal: Clement of al were actually putting
Roman law that was already in
place
- shaving of priest full beard was sign of manhood
- historians still debate boys' sexuality in Rome
- protections for free-born boys, not girls
and slaves

- sexual violence against boys was (a) a crime against the coming manhood and (b) a crime against the father.
- Perhaps through Christian idea of pedophilia is a protection of boys, not children in general
 - example #2 in handout
 - argues that Clement does not concern himself with children but with boys
 - Clement has no "global concern for children"
- But Clement's concern is not really for boys either, but for masculinity
- example #6: Clement insults victims of sex trafficking
- Clement's device is for masculinity and is therefore not particularly or exclusively Christian, but rather Roman
- His concern is for social stability
- Clement: an elite, hegemonic Christianity in the 2nd century
 - child was a rhetorical tool for Roman society
- "girls and enslaved children" basically do not exist
- free-born boys dominate

Alexander D. Perkins -- Rethinking παιδοφθορία: Sexual Ethics and “the Protection of Children” in Clement of Alexandria

NAPS 2022

Greek text: *Paedagogus*. Edited by M. Marcovich. Leiden: Brill, 2002

Translations in this handout are my own; therefore, so are any errors or infelicities.

1. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 2.10.88

Ἀπέχεσθαι τοίνυν σφοδρῶν τε ὀρέξεων καὶ ἐπαλλήλων συνουσιῶν καὶ τῆς πρὸς τὰς ἐγκύους ὁμιλίας καὶ ἀλληλοβασίας καὶ παιδοφθορίας καὶ μοιχείας καὶ λαγνείας ἢ τοῦ αἰνίγματος τοῦδε ἀπαγόρευσις παρήνεσεν.

Therefore, the advice enjoined by this riddle [don't eat hare] is to abstain from excessive desire, frequent sex, sex with pregnant women, mutual penetration, the corruption of boys, adultery, and lechery.

2. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 2.10.89

Ταύτη τοι ἀναφανδόν, οὐ δι' αἰνιγμάτων ἔτι, ὁ αὐτὸς ἀπηγόρευσεν Μωυσῆς γυμνῇ τῇ κεφαλῇ, “Οὐ πορνεύσεις, οὐ μοιχεύσεις, οὐ παιδοφθορήσεις” λέγων.

Such things Moses, himself, with his head uncovered, clearly—and not by means of a riddle—forbade, saying do not commit prostitution, do not commit adultery, and do not corrupt boys.

3. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 2.10.89, cont.

ἐπιθυμία γὰρ κακῆ ὄνομα ὕβρις, καὶ τὸν τῆς ἐπιθυμίας ἵππον “ὑβριστὴν” ὁ Πλάτων προσεῖπεν, “Ἴπποι θηλυμανεῖς ἐγενήθητέ μοι” ἀναγνοῦς.”

Alexander D. Perkins -- Rethinking παιδοφθορία: Sexual Ethics and “the Protection of Children” in Clement of Alexandria

NAPS 2022

The name for bad desire is *hubris*. Plato calls the horse of passion “hubristic” when he says, “To me it seems you all have become like horses in heat for females.”

4. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 2.10.90

Χρῆ δὲ υἱοῦς μὲν ἡγεῖσθαι τοὺς παῖδας, εἰς δὲ τὰς γυναῖκας τὰς ἀλλοτρίας ὡς ἰδίας ἀφορᾶν θυγατέρας κρατεῖν τε ἡδονῶν γαστρός τε ἔτι καὶ τῶν ὑπὸ γαστέρα δεσπόζειν ἀρχικώτατον.

It is necessary, then to guide boys as though they were [our] sons, and to look upon the wives of other men as though they were our own daughters. And [it is necessary] to have mastery over the pleasures of the belly as well as to have complete dominance over those pleasures below the belly.

5. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 2.10.90

Ἐχει γὰρ ὀρθῶς παντὸς μᾶλλον μή ποτε κοινωνεῖν καθάπερ θηλειῶν πρὸς μίξιν ἀφροδισίων τοῖς νέοις.

Refrain (as is proper) from taking part in sexual pleasures with young men as though they were female.

6. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 3.3.21

Ἄλλ’ οὐδὲ συνιᾶσιν οἱ ταλαίπωροι, ὡς τὸ ἄδηλον τῆς συνουσίας πολλὰς ἐργάζεται τραγωδίας. Παιδὶ πορνεύσαντι καὶ μαχλώσαις θυγατράσιν ἀγνοήσαντες πολλάκις μίγνυνται πατέρες, οὐ μεμνημένοι τῶν ἐκτεθέντων παιδίων, καὶ ἄνδρας δείκνυσι τοὺς γεγεννηκότας ἀκρασίας ἐξουσία.

But these miserable men do not understand, for the uncertainty of that intercourse [i.e. sleeping with a sex worker] creates a lot of tragedy. Fathers often knowingly

Alexander D. Perkins -- Rethinking παιδοφθορία: Sexual Ethics and “the Protection of Children” in Clement of Alexandria

NAPS 2022

have sex with a whoring boy and wanton maidservants, not remembering the children he had exposed. And so, intemperate license offers up parents as husbands.

7. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 3.11.73

Οὐδὲ ὑπὸ οἰκετῶν ἀναστρέφεσθαι χρή πρὸς τὸ σιμὸν ὠθουμένους, ὥσπερ τοὺς τρυφητικωτέρους ὀρῶμεν, ἐρρωμένους εἶναι δοκοῦντας, ὑπὸ μαλακίας δὲ ψυχικῆς διατεθρυμμένους. Ἄνδρὸς δὲ γενναίου σημεῖον οὐδὲν εἶναι δεῖ περιφανὲς ἐν τῷ προσώπῳ μαλακίας, ἀλλ’ οὐδὲ ἐν ἑτέρῳ μέρει τοῦ σώματος. Μὴ τοίνυν μηδὲ ἐν κινήσεσιν μηδὲ ἐν σχέσεσιν εὐρεθεῖη ποθ’ ἢ ἀσχημοσύνη τῆς ἀνανδρίας.

Nor is it permitted for those being pushed uphill to be turned around by their slaves, as we see more luxurious men do, who seem to be healthy, yet are actually enervated by such psychological effeminacy. There should be no conspicuous sign of effeminacy on the countenance of a high-born man, or for that matter on any other part of his body. Therefore, let no disgrace of unmanliness be found in his movements or his comportment.

8. Clem. Al. *Paed.* 3.3.21

Καὶ νῦν μὲν εἰς τοσοῦτον ἀκολασίας ἐλήλακεν ὁ βίος ἐντροφώσης ἀδικίας, καὶ τὸ λάγνον πᾶν ἐπικέχυται ταῖς πόλεσι νόμος γενόμενον· ἐπὶ τέγουσ ἐστᾶσι παρ’ αὐτοῖς τὴν σάρκα τὴν ἑαυτῶν εἰς ὕβριν ἡδονῆς πιπράσκουσαι γυναῖκες, καὶ παῖδες ἀρνεῖσθαι τὴν φύσιν δεδιδραγμένοι προσποιοῦνται γυναῖκες.

And now life has gone to such an extent of licentiousness and unrighteous pleasure, and every kind of

Alexander D. Perkins -- Rethinking παιδοφθορία: Sexual Ethics and
“the Protection of Children” in Clement of Alexandria

NAPS 2022

lecherousness has flowed into our cities as though it were the law. Women stand in brothels, selling their own flesh for insolent pleasure, while boys taught to deny nature pretend to be women!

Armenius / Friday, May 27

Grant Gasse, "Armenius and the Other Ptolemy"

- Kanon

- J.'s technical terms can be found in other disciplines

- Ptolemy

- Hypothesis: hypotheses re: heavenly bodies

- Kanon: a table of measurements re: heavenly bodies

- Harmonica: he uses hypotheses and Kanon Kanon

- precise musical instruments

- a precise measurement of the principles of harmony

- the mathematical principles of harmony

- Kanon: a means of arriving at rational precision

- Armenius

- Book 1: 8, 10 (3)

- sometimes translators translate "hyp." & "Kanon" the same way

- Kanon in Armenius is the rule of faith

- Armenius spoke of apparent tensions in scriptural tradition as a harmony (some high notes, some low notes), but "a single ecclesial melody" (Hall)

- Kanon brings many voices into a single harmony

- Ptolemy's work gives Armenius' usage of these terms insight into

brilliant idea
↓
harmony

- Stephen Prusley, "A Living (rule of) Faith"

- monograph: Cultural Engagement in the Early Church

- The Rule of Faith

- interpreters inevitably go to utilitarianism
(it functions as a hermeneutical key to the interpretation of scripture)

* - Prusley: the rule expresses reality of spiritual life (a succinct description of spiritual reality);
not just hermeneutical

- catechesis and identity formation

↓
- Christians in Roman Empire struggled with identity

- Irenaeus, concerned about theological boundaries

- argues for pre-baptismal catechesis

- not as intense for Jews as for pagans
(same for evangelization)

- Irenaeus does not give time frame, but a long period of time

- baptism was a major occasion for pagans

- "a radical reversioning of first principles"

- the rule of faith is the foundation of the building

- the rule and reality

J.M.S.

- Kelly: rule was a condensed summary
 - fluid in its wording but fixed in its content

the rule
book
attributes

- ① the triadic structure is Trinitarian
- ② a salvation narrative structure holds the rule together
- the rule is a presentation of spiritual realities, not merely utilitarian or hermeneutical

- Paul Saig, "The Foundation of Irenaeus' Heresy"

Saig's
thesis

- Indent
- * the rule are tools for thinking more than the content of thought
- ancient mnemonics (sp?)
- ancient memory in antiquity
 - everybody was expected to have a trained memory
 - maybe everybody literate (educated)
 - memoria res: memory of things
 - memoria verborum: " " " words

- Method of loci

- ① treasure house: storing of ideas
 - ② icon: an image to store (mental files you wanted to item.)
 - ③ thesaurus (?)
- fixed icon in place - complex connections between icons

melody
C?
L?

- close your eyes, walk through house/palace, looking at images until you found what you are looking for
 - an educational path or journey
- meditation, "thinking practice"; "bringing something to mind"
- practiced by Jews, Christians, Greeks
 - by training the mind we can grasp reality and come to love God
 - use this to fight temptation
 - a spiritual practice for the baptized
- * - Bandout - Socrates memory palace

- Cody Barnhart, "The Lord Spat on the Ground and Made Clay"

- Socrates about Jesus to be the creator
- Against Heresies: 5.15 - turning point
- tension: if flesh and blood will not without the earth (Qoanah??), how can that be since Christians hold to resurrection
- God is creator; resurrector
- Ezekiel 37 - valley of dry bones
- God's creative act is defined by His taking clay and giving it life

- John 9 - man born blind - is brought into play with Ephraim

- Irenaeus uses John 9 to ground God's identity in His creative work

- Irenaeus' Lamentation:

- literal reading: Jesus spitting clay shows him to be creator. Iren. says this is how original creat.

- spiritual reading: was this against Valenti. & Gnostics

- Arminius: substance

- spiritual reciprocity:

[contra the Valentines]

reciprocity

1 all of clay points to how God creates

2 Christ - hand of creation

→ 3 God sought Adam / the first

4 God speaks to Adam / the last

- for so, John 9 reads as a microcosm of God's economy

Henry and Discipline

Maroun El Hachem, "Foreign to divine order
and ecclesiastical rule"

- I could not hear a word of this
presentation.

I don't think anybody else can.

The lady actually stopped the young man
and asked him to speak louder.

There moved to the front of the small room
in an effort to make out what was
being said.

Honestly, this guy will have to figure
out a way to be heard.

Place on the mountain.

Frustrating. Wanted to hear this:

- something to do with Melitius and Athanasius
- presenter is being questioned about whether
or not it is right to call Melitius
"rebellious"
- presenter is saying that this is what
other bishops will hear
- problem seems to be that Melitius moved to
Alexandria and starting organizing others

Charles Rivera, "A World of Modes and
Fades!"

- Ephrem: against Marcion, Mani, and
- " " alleges that these heresies teach multiple first principles and that that is a departure from Christianity
- against the Manichaeans
 - Ephrem: why would darkness seek light "imagining (auterity?)"
 - especially, can there be more than one first principle
 - how can Ephrem enter into matter faith "to recasting it"
- Manichaeism
 - light is trapped in elements of light and dark
 - one day, eschatologically, light will break free and darkness will be imprisoned
- Ephrem: if dark is eternal, why would it want to free light?
 - attacks "ontological bawling"
 - anti-honey writers often contradict and satirize
 - dark and light are originally utterly distinct

A World of Moles and Fishes: The Critique of Dualist Cosmology in Ephrem's *Discourses to Hypatius*

(Translations of Ephrem are my own; translation of text 3 is from the source cited)

Text 1

"For it never would have been pleasant to the darkness to leave its place, because every Being which exists, if it exists in its place it is contented because it is the place of its nature, like fish in water, like moles in a burial vault; like a moth in clothing, like the boring worm in wood; like a weevil in the granary; like a swallow in cultivated land, like an owl in the wilderness; like a dove in the light, like a bat at night. The dwelling of their nature is pleasant to these, with many others, and if someone should exchange those things proper to them for those which are not, (that is, locations which are injurious to them for those not injurious to them) it is a great evil to them and a bitter wound...

For if you bathe a fish in oil and bury a mole in honey, let a moth loose in silver and a boring worm in gold and a weevil in a heap of pearls, although indeed these things are more excellent than what is proper to them, they rest contented in what is proper to them. And if these things, which have been created and are not a Being, rest contented in the positions which were created for them, how much the more so will the Being of darkness rest contented in the abode of its nature? And if someone urges it to leave, it is painful, as it is to a mole of the darkness, when someone brings it up from its place of darkness." (Mitchell, Bevan, and Burkitt, *S. Ephraim's Prose Refutations of Mani, Marcion, and Bardaisan* [London: Williams and Norgate, 1912-1921], I,40,16-41,40)

Text 2

"But if there are two places, and good and evil dwell in them, I will depict them from things that are clear and easy to imagine, so they can be plain to the audience. So, let us suppose there is a great river, clear and pure, and in it desirable fish, and there is a crypt odious, filthy, and loathsome, and moles within it. And let us take the moles dwelling in the darkness as an image of the Sons of Darkness, let us take the beautiful fish as a beautiful likeness of the Sons of Light, and let us suppose that their places border on one another, the water by the crypt and the dry land by the wet...

If then these things which are somewhat kindred to one another are so very alien in their places and sure in their natures and do not venture to cross their boundary, how much the more so ought Good and Evil to be in their natures and places, since they are real Beings and really alien to one another...When the mole goes along in his proper place, he keeps going and when it stops, [he stops] and smells that he would reach the boundary of the water and he turns back again to go into his proper place. And so also the fish, suited to the depths, comes to his proper place and when it stops, he turns back to his depths." (Mitchell et al., *Prose Refutations* I,72,23-74,24)

Text 3

"They rot upon a couch of darkness; in lust and in pursuit of desire they give birth to each other and then destroy each other.

The bellicose Prince of Darkness has subjugated the five pits of death through great... terror and wrath,

He has spurted forth streams of poison and wickedness from the depth." (trans. Hans-Joachim Klimkeit, *Gnosis on the Silk Road: Gnostic Texts from Central Asia* [New York: Harper Collins, 1993], p. 36)

- Text 1: Ephraim wishes that these animals have no desire for anything but what is proper to them
 - or too with eternal opposite opposites (light and darkness)
- In some ways Ephraim actually does enter the thought world of the Manichaean
- A Man. might counter - counter: Ephraim's model example - that the darkness is not happy and contented (Text #3 on handout)
- Ephraim has perhaps re-imagined the Man. austerity in terms of the separation of the Father and the Son
- " " reimagines it as an image of the Trinity